

20 October 2014

Graeme Cahalane
Manager Monitoring and Crown Ownership
Tertiary Education Commission
PO Box 27048
Wellington 6141

Dear Graeme

Western Institute of Technology at Taranaki ("WITT")

1. The Tertiary Education Commission ("TEC", "you") engaged Deloitte to conduct an independent review of specific aspects of the WITT delivery of the National Certificate of Maori Performing Arts (Performance) and National Diploma in Maori Performing Arts (Tutoring) Programmes ("the programmes"). We conducted our review in conjunction with an NZQA review of the delivery of the same programmes.
2. You have requested that we report to you on the methodology that we followed in our review and our findings in relation to the programmes' delivery and specifically the number of learning hours. These findings are set out for you in this letter.

Background

3. The WITT campus is located in New Plymouth, Taranaki. The institute offers a variety of National Certificate, Diploma and Degree courses. Since 2009, the National Certificate and National Diploma in Maori Performing Arts has been taught to several cohorts, by a group of tutors. These tutors are employees of WITT, although the majority of them are not based at the campus.
4. The delivery of the programmes was usually offsite in a variety of locations including Patea, Hawera and Auckland. It seems that the tutors had responsibility for identifying potential students and it was common for a cohort to be made up of a kapa haka group that already had some association with the tutor.
5. You have advised us that concerns around the delivery of the programmes has been brought to your attention and investigated by yourselves and an independent third party engaged by WITT. At the conclusion of this investigation, a lack of clarity still existed in relation to the number of learning hours delivered. As a result, you specifically asked us to focus our investigation on this aspect.

Methodology

6. After receiving background information from TEC and NZQA, we spent two days on site at WITT (on 9 & 10 September 2014) conducting our investigation. In order to gain an understanding of the programmes delivery we relied on the following sources of information:

Deloitte refers to one or more of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited, a UK private company limited by guarantee, and its network of member firms, each of which is a legally separate and independent entity. Please see www.deloitte.com/nz/about for a detailed description of the legal structure of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited and its Member Firms.

A member of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited

- Interviews with three programme tutors;
 - Interviews with other WITT staff members;
 - Interviews with students;
 - Financial records, particularly invoices from tutors claiming reimbursements for Wananga noho marae;
 - Email records;
 - Assessment and learning material
 - Programme document
7. Once we had conducted our analysis, we presented a verbal briefing of our findings at a meeting attended by TEC, NZQA & WITT. You have requested that we now set out our findings to you in writing in relation to the learning hours that were delivered.

Findings – Programme Delivery

8. NZQA's findings in relation to the Level 6 programme were presented to TEC and us. We accept NZQA's conclusions that they have no confidence in the validity of any of the Level 6 qualifications. On this basis, we have not conducted any further assessment of this programme.
9. In relation to the Level 4 programme, we compiled the data that we received from all sources. We focussed our assessment of learning hours on the teaching hours component and we have not assessed the self-directed learning hours component. We determined that the most comprehensive information regarding the teaching hours was the tutor invoices. We found that the tutors were responsible for organising weekend Wananga nohos to be held offsite (usually at a marae). The tutors would then arrange that WITT would be invoiced for the costs of the noho, [REDACTED]. These invoices usually recorded the number of students attending and the dates of the noho. An underlying assumption in relying on these records is that all of the nohos were held and made available to all of the funded students.
10. We were provided with finance system listings of payments to the suppliers that WITT advised us were relevant and we reconciled these back to the individual cohorts that the programme was delivered to. This enabled us to identify how many weekend Wananga nohos were delivered for each cohort.
11. The programme document sets out that each weekend noho will comprise 34.5 hours. We identified that these noho's commonly took place over three days, but we did not establish whether or not the required number of teaching hours was delivered. In the absence of any further information and for the purpose of our analysis, we have assumed that for those cohorts whose students were in prison that the weekend noho's comprised 20 hours of teaching and for all other cohorts that they comprised 34.5 hours.
12. We also considered the other information that we had collected, particularly from tutors, students and emails. This enabled us to form a view as to whether or not any additional learning hours were likely to have been completed for each cohort. In some cases we spoke to students or tutors who were able to give us direction on what additional hours (if any) were provided. If we have not been able to speak to any staff or students and have no email or other evidence of additional learning we have been guided by feedback from WITT. In some instances we have assumed that weekly three hour learning sessions were also available over a 34 week period.
13. The following table sets out our high level assessment, per cohort, of the number of teaching hours that in our view were likely to have been delivered. We have included a column that shows the number of teaching hours as a percentage of the number of contact hours that are set out in the programme document (432 hours).

Summary of Level 4 Cohorts – National Certificate in Maori Performing Arts



Source: WITT financial records and enrolment data, student interviews, tutor interviews

14. The table illustrates that there was a significant diversity in the number of the teaching hours delivered, which is likely to be driven by a lack of oversight by WITT to ensure consistent delivery, in respect of both quality and quantity of learning. It appears that it was the tutors that drove the delivery with little guidance or support from the WITT Wananga staff in New Plymouth. Therefore, the teaching hours delivery of the programme is best assessed on a cohort basis rather than across the board.

15. We hope that this information is of assistance to you, but please ensure that you contact us if there are any further points that you wish us to cover.

Yours sincerely
DELOITTE

